

**Village of Franklin
Historic District Commission
Regular Meeting
Wednesday, February 3, 2016 7:00 P.M.
At the Franklin Village Hall – Broughton House
32325 Franklin Road, Franklin, Michigan**

I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

The Regular Meeting of the Historic District Commission was called to order by Gary Roberts, Chairman, at the Franklin Village Hall, 32325 Franklin Rd, Franklin, MI at 7P.M.

II. ROLL CALL

Present: Eileen Harryvan, Garrett Keais, Gary Roberts, Gayle Timmis, Laura Witty

Absent: Mike Brassfield, Jill Wilke

Also Present: Amanda Davis, Consultant; Eileen Pulker, Clerk; Bill Dinnan, Building Official

III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Roberts requested that the following items be added to the agenda: **VII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS, E. Discuss Broughton House Update and F. Discuss Pending Michigan House Bill 5232.**

Motion by Timmis, seconded by Harryvan to adopt the agenda, as amended.

Motion was approved unanimously.

IV. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

A. Regular Meeting of Wednesday, November 4, 2015.

Motion by Harryvan, seconded by Keais to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of November 4, 2015, as presented.

Motion was approved unanimously.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENTS

No comments were made at this time.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

A. Consider Building Addition at 26088 German Mill Road.

John Tagle, John Tagle Associates, Inc., architect for the project and representing the owners, Eric and Christine Perry, gave a brief history of the home. Mrs. Perry was also present in the event that there may be additional questions. Tagle explained the addition would be a first floor master bedroom suite, laundry room, office, dinette, foyer, and storage area. The proposed addition would be on the rear of the existing home, so as not to interfere with the historic portion of the house adding that an earlier addition had been built but the date is unknown. The visual qualities of the original historic home would be preserved: the roof line, the chimney, the windows, and the exterior materials. The proposed addition does not even touch the original house as it abuts up to the former addition. The addition is a single story element and sets back from the original two-story home. The roof slopes of the new addition reflect the roof slopes of the former addition. The selected materials are compatible with the original home: lap-siding and trim (HardiePlank Lap Siding in Evening Blue) which looks similar to the original

construction but would be differentiated by the color. Other materials include: new brick pavers at the new entry and in the courtyard which would match what is currently there; and a new water feature is proposed at the open end of the courtyard to offer privacy. The location of the addition in the large backyard does not change the overall character of the site or the adjacent lots. The owners would like to add some shutters.

Roberts re-affirmed that the proposed color of the addition would be in contrast with the original structure thereby differentiating it from the original house. The siding dimensions would be the same as the existing ones. Roberts also addressed the fencing between the Perry's house and the neighbor's property to the north. He made a suggestion which might help in visually increasing the width of the lot and to avoid a narrow gap between neighboring fences.

Dinnan confirmed that the original house and garage are existing non-confirming structures adding that Mr. Tagle would need to go before the Zoning Board for two (2) variances.

Tagle stated that all the windows would be insulated wood.

Roberts inquired about the color of the asphalt shingles, to which Mr. Tagle replied that it had not been chosen but he would provide that information to the HDC when it was decided upon, noting that it would be in the same family as what is currently on the existing home. Roberts stated that the HDC would like to see all the materials and colors before a permit is issued.

The subject of new shutters was discussed, with Roberts explaining that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation would describe them as being "conjectural elements" and unless any documentation could be found of their prior existence they should not be added.

Motion by Keais, seconded by Harryvan to approve the plans for the building addition at 26088 German Mill Road, as submitted and dated 12/29/2015 with the understanding that the applicant will come back to HDC with a proposed selection of materials, including shingles, wood windows with wood dividers, and a correspondence with the neighbors regarding the fence, subject to Zoning Board of Appeals approval. This determination is subject to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Roll Call Vote:

Harryvan Aye
Keais Aye
Roberts Abstain
Timmis Aye
Witty Aye
Motion carried.

B. Consider Building Addition at 25850 Romany Way.

Due to a conflict of interest, Chairman Roberts recused himself and vacated the dais, with Vice Chairman Keais presiding over the discussion of this particular agenda item.

Bill Finnicum, Finnicum Brownlie Architects, project architect, presented this project to HDC on behalf of the owner Beverly Neumann, who was also present to answer any questions. Finnicum explained that the purpose of the addition is to convert the house into a barrier-free home, by adding an outside elevator to access the three (3) stories and a barrier-free master bath. Finnicum provided a brief history and explained the floor plan of the home. Roberts added that the expansion is 7 feet and would be on the east side of the structure; everything else is internal. Roberts complimented Finnicum on his ability to blend it in with the existing structure and its surroundings.

Even though the house is not historical it is located in the Historic District. The new materials would match the brick and siding of the existing structure. Roberts elaborated on the future historic importance of the structure, its architect, Ken Neumann and how his wife has and is preserving its integrity.

Keais asked Davis for guidance with regards to the significance of this home within the historic district. Davis explained that it even though it is located in the Historic District; it is not historic so the approval would merely be a formality. She added that with Mrs. Neumann's stewardship the house is still creating its own story.

Keais inquired if there were any trees which would be affected by the addition. Finnicum stated that his design accommodated the roots of one pine tree so as to preserve the tree.

Motion by Timmis, seconded by Witty to approve the building addition at 25850 Romany Way, as submitted, January 14, 2016. It is a non-historic house in the Historic District.

Ayes: Harryvan, Keais, Timmis, Witty

Nays: None

Abstain: Roberts

Absent: Brassfield, Wilke

Motion carried.

B. Consider Demolition Application at 26675 Normandy.

Charles Whitelaw, owner and contractor Whitelaw Custom Homes, Inc. representing the owners Marc and Allyssa Tushman, explained his involvement with the project. The owners wish to demolish the structure and to construct a new, two (2) story home. The pine trees along the road would be protected but some trees inside the new building envelope which would have to come down. He is working with the Village and the arborist, having submitted all the applications. All structures, including the pool, pool house, and barn, which is not historic, would be demolished.

Motion by Witty, seconded by Timmis to recommend to Village Council the approval of the demolition application for the house and structures at 26675 Normandy and issue a demolition permit, as they have found that there is no historic significance to this property. This determination is subject to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Trees will be saved according to Village Ordinances.

Ayes: Harryvan, Keais, Roberts, Timmis, Witty
Nays: None
Absent: Brassfield, Wilke
Motion carried.

VII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Discuss Barn on Franklin Farms Condominium Property.

Roberts reported that a contractor has completed a detailed estimate. The first phase would be about \$9,700 to replace the beam on the failed side where the gambrel roof meets the shed and patch the roof. Full restoration which would include replacing the windows, the cost for which is estimated at close to \$48,000. Resident Dave Bing has been appointed the liaison from the Condominium Board to Mrs. Patel, who wants to get this accomplished. Roberts noted that he has invited Mr. Bing to meet with him and Bill Lamott, from the Historical Society, to facilitate this project. As for funding, the Franklin Foundation, through the Franklin Historical Society stewardship, might give a matching grant to the Condo Association for the purpose of stabilizing the structure. If Mrs. Patel is able to get legal control of the barn and its property she is willing to invest the rest of the money herself. She will be contacting a well-known attorney to assist her in this project. There are several funding options which will be pursued.

B. Certified Local Government, possible future projects.

Roberts updated the HDC on the issue of procuring a bid on doing some pedestrian circulation planning. After researching the idea, it was found that anything that has to do with the CLG needs to be put out in an RFP and be bid out. Roberts inquired if Davis could be “appointed” to help with the re-districting effort and thusly, circumvent that process. Davis stated that she will research that idea. It was Roberts hope to combine the re-districting with the continuation of the QR coding project.

Roberts requested that Davis write a specification of QR codes for bidding.

C. Discuss 32220 Franklin Road (Huda School), Landscaping, Approved Site Plan.

Roberts stated that he had spoken with John Staran, Village Attorney, and Jim Creech, Village Administrator, about the issue of enforcing the maintenance of the landscape as proposed in the original site plan.

Discussion ensued regarding the wording of Village Ordinances and motions and the enforcement of those Ordinances vs. Motions. It was suggested that this issue be forwarded to the Planning Commission for its review. Pulker, Village Clerk, will write a letter to the Commission requesting that when it reviews the Ordinances that it would consider including wording which would require all commercial properties to have some type of irrigation and the requirement that the landscape plan must be maintained for “x” amount of time.

This item will remain on the agenda for further discussion.

D. Discuss 32760 Franklin Road (Franklin Grill), Approved Site Plan.

Roberts reviewed the subject of the demolition/replacement of an out-building which was once situated behind the Franklin Grill. Again, there appears to be an issue with the wording of the

demolition/replacement motion as it did not specify a time frame for its replacement. The HDC expressed interest in making contact with the current owner to see if there is a potential seasonal use for the rebuilding of a similar shed to that which was demolished at the east end of the current outdoor patio area thereby screening the parking lot to the east.

There was a discussion centered on the strength and effectiveness of the motions. This item was to remain on the agenda for further discussion as the HDC places an important emphasis on out building preservation which was, in this case committed to by the then applicant.

E. Discuss Broughton House Update.

Roberts reviewed and provided an update of the project and led a discussion as to whether a formal application should be filed. It was noted that while the project is maintenance based with no new additions externally, a formal review is not necessary; however the Commissioners requested that a preview of the project be provided for their own comprehension of the project. Clerk Pulker agreed to facilitate an HDC application for the next agenda.

F. Discuss Pending Michigan House Bill 5232.

Witty synopsisized the pending bill, stressing that it erodes the local control over our Historic District, its boundaries and building materials. Adding that among other things it would disrupt the current HDC process and would require all Historic Districts re-certify every 10 years, which can be very lengthy and time consuming. Most disturbing is that it would de-emphasize the importance of the guidelines set forth by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Those guidelines would become "suggestions" which need not be followed.

Roberts urged the members of the HDC to contact Jeremy Moss, State Representative for the 35th House District and Vice Chair of the House Local Government Committee, to voice their opinions. Davis encouraged members to write to the two (2) sponsors of this bill outlining HDC's responsibilities to Franklin, etc. She has done so by writing a letter from her perspective of working in the Village.

Davis will keep HDC apprised of all communications relative to this matter, noting that swift action to oppose this legislation is appropriate.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:30P.M.

Submitted,

Gail Beke, Recording Secretary

Eileen H. Pulker, Clerk